

The Organization Performance Analysis of Citi Trans –A Travel Company Based on Balanced Scorecard in Bandung

Bambang Hermanto, Rivani

Abstract— This research was conducted with a main objective to analyze the performance of Citi Trans Travel Company in Bandung by using the Balanced Scorecard concept. Balanced Scorecard-based performance appraisal is basically a performance evaluation using an integrated four main perspectives, namely financial perspective, customer perspective, internal business process perspective, and learning and growth perspectives.

The research method used in this research was the case study with the type of research was descriptive analytic study. Object taken in this research was Citi Trans Travel Company in the city of Bandung. Data used both primary and secondary data. The population of this research was all leaders and employees of Citi Trans Bandung. Whereas technique sampling used was purposive sampling technique, which was sample taken based on the consideration of the parties that know best about this topic of research, those are 11 persons from the management and from 4 persons from the employees, thus in total was 15 persons. For the validity of the data, this study used triangulation techniques, both sources and data collection techniques.

The conclusion of performance appraisal of Citi Trans based on Balanced Scorecard which measured by 4 dimensions was all those 4 dimensions were on “Good” categorize, with the highest total of score was Customer Dimension, and the lowest total of score was Financial Dimension. This showed us that Citi Trans had put the customer satisfaction as their company main priority. However Citi Trans needed put more attention on their level of cost efficiency without sacrificed their product or service quality.

Index Terms— Travel Company, Performance Analysis, Balance Scorecard

I. INTRODUCTION

The development of the transportation business has many varieties, like shuttle minibus, rail, and intercity buses. Businesses see opportunities in the field of travel. This is because it still minimal and lack of number of business travel in the city of Bandung. “Citra Tiara Transport Company” or better known as CitiTrans is one quite big travel in the city of Bandung. CitiTrans offers a variety - kinds of services other than travel, the service delivery of goods or services

documents with every 1 hour once there is a departure schedule.

Initial observation on the CitiTrans, researchers found some interesting phenomenon, including:

- Although CityTrans claims its market share is all segments, but based on their previous data, CitiTrans service users are 98% are upper middle class.
- Business growth from CityTrans, based on their data, has increased 35% from the previous year 2011.
- Despite the growing business trends, the CitiTrans admitted that it has been evaluating its main performance still using the financial statements as the main benchmark.

Based on this phenomenon, it is necessary to conduct an in-depth study on "The Organization Performance Analysis Based on Balanced Scorecard of CitiTrans - Travel Company in Bandung", so it is known in depth about the company's performance and know the problems and operational constraints as a basic material in planning and executing business operations more optimal.

II. RESEARCH OBJECTIVE

The objectives of this research is:

To examine the organization performance of CitiTrans in Bandung City based on the concept of performance measurement Balanced Scorecard.

III. THEORITICAL FRAMEWORK

A. Assessment of Organization Performance

Performance is something produced or the work achieved from a business. According to Hawkins¹, the notion of performance is: ...: (1) the process or manner of performing, (2) a notable action or achievement, (3) the performing of a play or other entertainment.

Based on this understanding, then the performance of the organization is something generated by an organization within a certain period with reference to the standards that set. The performance of the organization should be a measurable outcome and describe the empirical conditions of an organization of any agreed size.

While appraisal is a process or way of judging (Poerwadarminta²), performance appraisal proposed by Willy Susilo³, are:

"... a process quantifies accurately and validly the level of efficiency and effectiveness of an existing condition." Furthermore Willy Susilo explains that the purpose of the performance appraisal itself is to obtain information on the

Manuscript received Feb 07, 2018

Bambang Hermanto, Department of Business Administration, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia

Rivani, Department of Business Administration, Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung, Indonesia

effectiveness, efficiency and suitability of the principles of performance- the principle that wants to be realized.

The word appraisal is often interpreted by the word “assessment”. Associated with this, Hawkins¹ argues about the Assessment is (1) to decide or fix the amount of value, (2) to estimate the worth or quality or likelihood of. Given the performance of the organization is something that is produced by an organization within a certain period with reference to the standards set, thus the assessment of organizational performance implies a process or assessment system regarding the implementation of the work capabilities of an organization based on certain standards (Kaplan and Norton⁴).

B. Performance Assessment Based on Balanced Scorecard

In line with the development of organizational performance appraisal, the concept of the old model performance measure is being abandoned, as it is considered to be the only short-term profitability objective. Leaders of organizations that only require employees to optimize earnings usually apply performance measures that dimension only profitability only. The elements measured in this case are usually sales, cash flow, capital expenditure, costs, assets, debt, liabilities and so on (Martini Kuseini⁵).

The above measures are organizationally more easily measured in a qualitative way, so that external aspects are underestimated, such as the level of customer satisfaction, customer loyalty, employee retention, etc., so profit-oriented organizations cannot guarantee their sustainability in hypercompetitive global competition. Therefore, Kaplan and Norton⁴ introduced the Balanced Scorecard concept as a measuring system that tries to balance the old measurement tools with only dimension of profitability, with new dimensions as balancing elements. With this balanced scorecard is expected to integrate the organization's energy and organizational knowledge more specifically from the organization in order to achieve a more long-term goal.

Regarding the definition of Balanced Scorecard according to Kaplan and Norton⁴ are:

Balanced Scorecard is a measurement of corporate performance that translates mission and strategy into various objectives and measures composed into four perspectives: financial, customer, internal business processes, and learning growth. Scorecards provide frameworks, languages, to communicate missions and strategies. Scorecards use measurements to inform workers about the factors that drive current and future success.

From the definition, we can understand that the balance scorecard is a system of organizational performance measurement that can operationalize the mission and strategy of the company comprehensively and measurable.

IV. METHOD

The type of research used in this research is descriptive analytic which means to describe and explain the existing phenomenon when this research is conducted (Masri Singarimbun⁵), while this Research Method is case study method.

This study was conducted at Citi Trans Company in Bandung City with the total number of leaders and employees of these companies reached 242 people defined as the population of this study. Because the research is included in the type of descriptive research and in the design will use distributive frequency table, then for sampling technique can be done by means of purposive technique where the sample is taken on the basis of consideration of the needs of the research theme, i.e. from all staff at managerial level or leadership amount 11 people, plus 4 people each representatives from each position of support staff that consisting : the call center, ticketing section, driver section, and security section. Thus, the sample size of this study was 15 people. The reason for choosing the sample object is because the respondent can represent the person who has best understanding of the performance of the organization especially in terms of financial perspective, customer perspective, operational perspective and human resource development perspective.

Data collection techniques are divided into two, namely primary data and secondary data. For the purposes of the data validity from the analysis of this study, it is necessary to conduct inspection techniques. The technique used in this study is the triangulation technique.

V. DISCUSSION

A. Performance Appraisal by Financial Dimension

On the Balanced Scorecard concept, the financial dimension on the performance of CitiTrans Travel company can be measured by 4 main indicators, namely: level of income, operational cost level, working capital rate and return of investment. From result of recapitulation of respondent questionnaire data, can be seen in following table:

Table 1. Data of Respondent about CitiTrans Performance from Financial Dimension

No. of Item	Answer Alternatives					Total
	FA	A	LA	DA	FDA	
1	2 (5)	11 (4)	2 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15 (60)
2	2 (1)	10 (2)	3 (3)	0 (4)	0 (5)	15 (31)
3	1 (5)	9 (4)	5 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15 (56)
4	3 (5)	8 (4)	4 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15 (59)
Sum	8	38	14	0	0	60 (206)
Freq (%)	13 %	64 %	23 %	0 %	0 %	100%

(Sources: data processed, 2012) confirmed this data to the management of Citi Trans, indeed in this case the management cannot show in detail the figures of the company's financial statements. Nevertheless, they still can provide an overview of the outline of their financial performance. For the growth of business assets of the company, CitiTrans is indeed quite significant. This can be seen from the company's first trip standing with 4 minibuses in 2005, and in 2012 already has been more than 100 minibuses with the development of 10 pools spread across Bandung and Jakarta. The management also said that in 2012 they will add the minibuses of 80 units that worth about 24 billion rupiah, which means the minibuses in near of the future will be close to 200 units in total. Then on the increase of operational costs, the management admitted that from year to year the costs always increase, such as inflation every year, the reduction of government fuel subsidy, and the increase of spare parts prices from its minibuses. This does not include the fees that

often occur in the travel business. Nevertheless, their side always tried to make cost efficiency without sacrificing quality of service from CitiTrans. For example, establishing long-term cooperation with Isuzu company in terms of maintenance of their minibuses, the implementation of computer-based accounting system to minimize financial leakage, etc. Regarding the level of profitability, the management did not refuse to be called high, only they reluctant to mention the details of the figures.

B. Performance Appraisal by Customer Dimension

Organizational survival depends on how the organization maintains its customers and also gets new ones. Likewise with CitiTrans Travel Company, after running for almost 7 years, the Company has served not less than 30,500 customers. CitiTrans Company is required to have a good strategy in serving, retaining existing customers and finding new customers, so it is reasonable that the performance of the organization also consider the performance from the perspective of the customer. The following is the result of the responses of respondents regarding the performance of Citi Trans Company from the customer perspective:

Table 2. Data of Respondent about CitiTrans Performance from Customer Dimension

No. of Item	Answer Alternatives					Total
	FA	A	LA	DA	FDA	
5	3 (5)	10 (4)	2 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15(61)
6	0 (1)	0 (2)	3 (3)	9 (4)	3 (5)	15(60)
7	4 (5)	6 (4)	4 (3)	1 (2)	0 (1)	15(58)
8	4 (5)	10 (4)	1 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15(63)
Sum	11	26	10	10	3	60 (242)
Freq (%)	18%	43%	17%	17%	5%	100%

(sources: data processed, 2012)

The results of this questionnaire were generally in line with interviews of some management personnel and company employees stating that the level of complaints from customers were rare. Generally, complaints from customers about drivers were inconsiderate in driving, although it was always anticipated by the management as providing an evaluation of employees in accordance with each division of which of the complaints become benchmarks and feedback on the performance of our company to further improve service well. Then for customer satisfaction, by far the CitiTrans always distributing the small random questionnaires to simply measure the satisfaction of its customer, and according to this small survey result was the level of satisfaction of its customers showed an average above 85%.

C. Performance Appraisal by Internal Business Process Dimension

The most important factor of achieving customer satisfaction, beside service is also the quality of products or services. In order to produce a product with good quality, it demands a good operational system as well. In addition, innovation efforts in business processes are also needed to improve product quality in order to always win a tight business competition. Therefore, the next assessment of organizational performance is important to measure from the perspective of internal business processes, where dimensions are the degree of innovation to internal business processes, systems of production processes, and after sales services to their internal business processes. The following will be presented on the table of responses of respondents regarding

the performance of CitiTrans companies from internal business process dimensions, namely:

Table 3. Data of Respondent about CitiTrans Performance from Internal Business Process Dimension

No. of Item	Answer Alternatives					Total
	FA	A	LA	DA	FDA	
9	1 (5)	7 (4)	5 (3)	2 (2)	0 (1)	15(52)
10	3 (5)	9 (4)	3 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15(60)
11	4 (5)	9 (4)	2 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15(62)
12	5 (5)	9 (4)	1 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15(64)
Sum	8	19	9	0	0	60 (238)
Freq (%)	22%	57%	18%	3%	0%	100%

(sources: data processed, 2012)

The responses of the varied questionnaires of respondents seem to be aligned when confirmed by interviews to some management teams from CitiTrans who stated that the company actually already has a fairly complete standard operating procedures (SOP) of all its operations, including stages of process services and finance, as well as manuals for job descriptions in each position. Existing SOPs were good enough, where each division / section has their own SOP, the SOP will also make better if the individual is willing to implement as well as possible, for example: on the track, where each departure schedule or departure change will be listed on the division of the track division, so there is no error in the ticketing information, SOP is applied with good service (smile, greeting, friendly) to the customer, and by providing good and accurate information.

D. Performance Appraisal by Learning and Growth Dimension

When business process factors is good, then it will resulting in good services and products, therefore that consumers and customers feel satisfied which will have a positive impact on company profits financially. The next thing to note is the aspect of human resources that run the whole aspect of business. In the tight business competition, it is needed a work culture that builds professional human resources that not only have integrity and commitment to the organization, but also have the ability and willingness to always sharpen themselves to improve their competence. Therefore, the measurement of organizational performance also needs to be taken into account from the learning and growth perspective of all the resources in the organization. In this learning and growth perspective, the dimensions measured were the competence of human resources, the application of reliable information systems, and a supportive work culture. The following is a recap of the responses of respondents regarding the performance of Citi Trans organization measured from the perspective of learning and growth, namely:

Table 4. Data of Respondent about CitiTrans Performance from Learning and Growth Dimension

No. of Item	Answer Alternatives					Total
	FA	A	LA	DA	FDA	
13	0 (1)	0 (2)	3 (3)	7 (4)	5 (5)	15(62)
14	5 (5)	5 (4)	4 (3)	1 (2)	0 (1)	15(59)
15	3 (5)	9 (4)	3 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15(60)
16	3 (5)	9 (4)	3 (3)	0 (2)	0 (1)	15 (60)
Sum	11	23	13	8	5	60 (241)
Freq (%)	18%	38%	22%	13%	8%	100%

(sources: data processed, 2012)

At least, the results of this questionnaire were still in line with the information obtained from interviews with some people from the Management and Driver Team who stated that the work culture that built was actually enough to help personal team in work. Actually, the work culture created was not so specific, yet it was clear that good service was done according to existing SOPs for good service to customers. The atmosphere that has been built was like family, all person were enough to knew when to be serious and when to relax, and the position of headquarters in the middle of Bandung is also helping the process of communication and coordination quickly and easily from Pool to Pool. It just that sometimes the director of the management element that cannot always be in place due to manage other work affairs. Then when mentioned about the implementation of a reliable information system, in this company has been already facilitating the organization with a special room equipped with a computer and telephone. For computers, they already implement information systems although the network was still internal, but at least it was helpful to recompose data in a complete, fast and more efficient. As for the use of the website was tend to serve customers, both in terms of information and ticket reservations. In addition, the information in this company was also not always dominated by top management, but also it shared to the lower levels, especially at the moment of regular meetings or meetings that were incidental. Regarding competence, Management responds that the recruited employees have been through a good selection and recruitment system, and were supported with sufficient experience and background so that the Technical Team can rely on them to carry out their work. It was also tailored to the needs of the company, because beside they had recruitment from outside, sometimes they also rotated the office to avoid saturation of work and to increase the competence of their employees, especially on the management team.

E. Recapitulation of Performance Appraisal based on Balance Scorecard in CitiTrans

Posit the organization performance assessment based on Balanced Scorecard, it was generally accepted that the performance of Citi Trans Bandung had the scores which fall into the "Good" category in all four dimensions, either Finance dimension, Customer dimension, Internal Business Process Dimension, and Learning and Growth Dimension.

VI. CONCLUSION

Performance Measurement is however required by any organization for the organization's business development. Having know the performance of the organization, then it has a chance to realize where the potential and constraints, thus can pursue a more appropriate strategy. This study analyzes about the performance of a travel company: CitiTrans based on balanced scorecard in Bandung. Built upon the research, there were several things that can be concluded, namely:

- a. Posit the organization performance appraisal based on Balanced Scorecard, it was generally accepted that the performance of Citi Trans Bandung was categorized on the "Good" in all four dimensions, such as Finance dimension, Customer dimension, Internal Business Process, and Growth and Learning Dimension. When viewed from the total score of each dimension, then the dimension with the highest total score was the dimension

of the customer with a total score of 242 and the lowest total score was on the financial dimension with a total score of 206. This was indicated that the company has put the customer on the most important priority. However, the position of the lowest total score on the financial dimension also indicated that the CitiTrans was still in the investment development stage and should increase their attention on reducing costs efficiently without sacrificing the quality of the products and services.

- b. The business operational obstacles that need to be fixed were around the problem of timeliness, facility problems that required by students whom actually were their main market share, alternative payment method other than cash, driver less responsive, suitability of passenger seat number and their parking lot that were less spacious.

REFERENCES

- [1] Hawkins, R. P. 1979. "The functions of assessment: Implications for selection and development of devices for assessing repertoires in clinical, educational, and other settings". *Journal of Applied Behavior Analysis*, 12, 501-516.
- [2] Poerwadarminta, W.J.S. 1995. "Kamus Umum Bahasa Indonesia". Jakarta : PT.Balai Pustaka
- [3] Willy Susilo. 2002. "Audit Sumber Daya Manusia". Jakarta: PT. Vorqistatama Binamega.
- [4] Kaplan, Robert S., and David P. Norton. 1996. "The Balanced Scorecard: Translating Strategy into Action". Boston: Harvard Business School Press.
- [5] Masri Singarimbun. 1989. "Metode Penelitian Survey". Cetakan Pertama. Jakarta: LP3S.